

Approved by Planning Commission on
September 10, 2003
Approved by Development Review Board on
September 18, 2003



**SCOTTSDALE DEVELOPMENT REVIEW BOARD & PLANNING COMMISSION
SPECIAL JOINT STUDY SESSION
KIVA - CITY HALL
3939 N. DRINKWATER BOULEVARD
AUGUST 27, 2003
MINUTES**

PRESENT: Cynthia Lukas, Council Member
E.L. Cortez, Vice Chairman
Michael D'Andrea, Design Member
Jeremy Jones, Design Member
Michael Schmitt, Design Member
David Gulino, Chairman
Steve Steinberg, Vice Chairman
David Barnett, Commissioner
James Heitel, Commissioner
Eric Hess, Commissioner
Tony Nelssen, Commissioner
Jeffery Schwartz, Commissioner

ABSENT: Anne Gale, Design Member

STAFF: Kroy Ekblaw
Kurt Jones
Ed Gawf
Randy Grant
Jayna Shewak

CALL TO ORDER

The special joint study session of the Scottsdale Development Review Board and Planning Commission was called to order by Councilman Lukas at 3:05 p.m.

DISCUSSION OF THE SCOTTSDALE WATERFRONT PROJECT

MR. GAWF provided a brief overview of the project. He reviewed the Downtown Vision Principles. He discussed the focus area goals as follows:
Support long term fiscal health of downtown

APPROVED

- Active major corridors
- Marshall Way & Canal bank

Creates a Downtown neighborhood

- Residential Component
- Private and public gathering spaces
- Connect north bank and south bank

Embodiment of Scottsdale/southwestern character

Mr. Gawf reviewed the focus of the joint study session. Today's focus is to have a discussion with Development Review Board members regarding Site, Building and Character Design. He reported the Planning Commission would review this proposal on September 10, 2003 as it relates to in fill incentive district, amended development standards and the planning and zoning questions.

Mr. Gawf stated the City Council would act as the Development Review Board for the section of land that is east of Marshall Way. The rest of the project will go through the Development Review Board with appeal to the City Council at a future date.

Mr. Gawf reviewed the discussion points:

- Architecture
- Site Plan
- Context
- Height
- Mixture of Uses
- Marshall Way Orientation

Mr. Gawf reviewed the tests for height that should be considered when reviewing this project. He noted they are encouraging residential on this project.

COMMISSIONER NELSEN requested Mr. Gawf to explain in his words what the embodiment of Scottsdale/southwestern character is. Mr. Gawf stated that is a tough one and they have struggled with that. They are not quite sure what it is but it can't be Chicago, Hong Kong or San Francisco but it has to be something that when you see it you say that is Scottsdale Arizona. Commissioner Nelsen inquired if it would be safe to say that if this project moves forward it would define the embodiment of Scottsdale and southwest character. Mr. Gawf stated he thought it helps, noting there are other projects that are doing that throughout the community. They might want to discuss, which ones

do that. He reported they needed to have a clearer definition of what theme and what concepts they are looking for in that area. Commissioner Nelssen stated he would agree.

COUNCILMAN LUKAS stated the group should discuss what they would view to be uniquely Scottsdale because that is very relative to the discussion about architecture.

COMMISSIONER SCHWARTZ inquired where the benchmark for measuring the height is from. Mr. Gawf provided information on how the heights of the buildings would be calculated.

MR. CORTEZ inquired about the timing of the Development Review Board's review of the elevations and site plan for the Camelback and Scottsdale Road elevations. Mr. Gawf discussed the timing for the project.

LARRY HEINEY, HNS International, provided background information on their company and discussed the projects they have done in Scottsdale. He also provided an overview of the proposed architecture for the project. He reviewed the site plan, elevations and discussed the context. He also reviewed the materials they would be using. He discussed the high quality of the project.

COMMISSIONER STEINBERG inquired about the phasing of the building and how they intend to build it. Mr. Heiney reviewed phase one of the project. Commissioner Steinberg inquired about the construction access. Mr. Heiney pointed out where the construction access would occur. Commissioner Steinberg inquired why the retail edge is first as opposed to doing the residential first. Normally the retail is dependent on the residential so why not do the residential first and the retail second. Mr. Heiney stated the retail could be pre-leased versus with residential they have to get the approval before the sales can occur. Mr. Gawf stated from a staff standpoint, they encouraged them to build the Marshall Way edge that will activate Marshall Way, and will correspond with the opening of the canal bank improvement and the bridge.

JOHN BERRY, Beus Gilbert, 4800 N. Scottsdale Road, legal counsel for the developer, stated they have taken several iterations of this plan out to the community. He further stated the first iteration of the plan was much more density, much more height. They have lowered the height, reduced the density from the last plan the community saw. As part of that public outreach, there was a lot of concern regarding what would happen if one of the residential buildings gets built first and something happens and the rest of the project is not completed. Then you would have a residential building in the middle of these 11 acres with nothing around it.

Commissioner Steinberg stated the edge along Camelback and Marshall Way is strong, but it weakens along the canal. He inquired why they created two separate disjointed plazas just by the site planning of J and K rather than straightening out J and K and creating one major plaza with a mixed use open area within that could create a livelier courtyard space. Mr. Heiney stated they looked at those alternatives. He discussed the concerns with building anything parallel to the canal.

Commissioner Steinberg requested information on the vehicular access and service and trash removal. He stated it seems very tight and it seems like a lot of methods of circulation are concentrated in one area. Mr. Heiney reviewed the circulation on the site.

Commissioner Steinberg inquired if all of the open spaces were open to the public. Mr. Heiney stated there are two private spaces for the residence of the buildings.

MR. JONES stated there would be a lot of digging to build the garages. He inquired how long trucks would be hauling dirt through Scottsdale. Mr. Heiney stated he did not know the answer to that. He further stated they are in the process of putting that information together.

COMMISSIONER BARNETT inquired if there were any sidewalks along the canal that access the open spaces between J and K.

BETTY DRAKE stated there is a path long both sides of the canal along with a landscape palette. She provided an overview of the outdoor public spaces and trail system for this project. She stated they are trying to work with the aspects of Scottsdale's history.

COMMISSIONER BARNETT inquired if the trail goes straight up to the canal or is there some sort of setback and then the trail. He also inquired if it comes right up to the canal what is to prevent someone from jumping into the canal. Ms. Drake stated there is a separation between the canal and the path and there would be landscaping. Mr. Gawf stated the sun circle trail is on the south side and they would have a paved trail and there will be a continuous trail on the north side. He further stated he has more detailed plans if they desire to see them.

MR. D'ANDREA stated he has seen the earlier iterations of this project and he would like to commend the team for the massing and volumes of the site. He inquired when you look at the retail on the south side of the canal is that bridge proposed to bring vehicular traffic. He also inquired about the connection across Scottsdale Road and the canal because it is a big entertainment district, if there was any thought given to drawing people across Scottsdale Road Down through the canal into the park. Mr. Gawf stated there would not be vehicular traffic across the bridge. This is intended to be a village square point where people come together to attend events and activities.

COMMISSIONER SCHWARTZ asked what elements of the downtown drove your team to come up with the architectural theme of the project. Mr. Heiney stated the buildings in the downtown were the Loloma project and the Old Scottsdale High School as well as some properties in north Scottsdale influenced the architectural theme. Commissioner Schwartz inquired if there was consideration taken from the surrounding elements of Fashion Square and the Galleria. Mr. Heiney replied in the negative.

Commissioner Schwartz stated he would agree with Mr. D'Andrea's comments about vehicle traffic across Marshall Way. He further stated he thought it would behoove them to look at the circulation element for vehicular access on the north canal bank because it is difficult if you are on the north canal bank to get to the south canal.

Commissioner Schwartz asked a series of questions regarding the height. Mr. Heiney provided information on where the height is measured.

Commissioner Schwartz inquired about the product mix for the project. Mr. Heiney remarked mix is still being worked out but the average would be 1300 to 1600 square feet.

Commissioner Schwartz inquired if there was a rendering showing both of the towers side by side. Mr. Heiney replied there was not. Commissioner Schwartz requested they provide that rendering for the Planning Commission hearing.

Commissioner Schwartz stated he thought an important element would be to bring more height into the landscaping than just the desert theme of the landscaping.

Commissioner Schwartz stated his other concern has to do with the site plan, noting he knows there has been a lot of work done and several iterations over the last six years of the project. He further stated he thought they are losing the sense of what the canal bank was set out to be regarding the interaction of the canal bank and the synergy of the canal bank. It has become more open space for the development. He further remarked he would encourage some discussion on how they can help themselves along the canal bank because he felt like they are turning their backs on it and it is becoming a trail. He noted he did not think a trail system was intended for this canal bank. He further noted it is a high-energy zone. He reported this is the best location in the State of Arizona Scottsdale Road and Camelback. He concluded they need some sense of synergy and interaction of people along this canal bank.

COUNCILMAN LUKAS requested ~~that~~ they structure their discussion and focus their comments on the architecture on Marshall Way **AND ON THE TWO RESIDENTIAL BUILDINGS. COUNCILMAN LUKAS ALSO REQUESTED THAT THEY COMMENT ON THE POINTS OF DISCUSSION THAT MR. GAWF LISTED.**

COMMISSIONER NELSEN stated he would agree this project has come along way and he would congratulate the design team. He further stated on Marshall Way and Camelback he felt the project was 95 percent there. He remarked the issue is how it relates to the residential behind it. The use of the materials needs to be drawn into the building behind it. He further remarked he is very concerned with what the people driving by on the street see. He noted there is something missing in the middle of the building. He further noted he felt they should put in larger trees because they do have a water source and it would help with the scale of the buildings.

MR. JONES remarked it is always a tough thing to define the local character particularly if you don't do it looking backward. He further remarked there may be some elements from our history but it is unfortunate that they cannot think about what Scottsdale could become and achieve the same pleasant feelings without relying on nostalgia.

Mr. Jones commented the next kind of mall that Westcor did after Fashion Square was to do an indoor/outdoor combination. They used the outdoor spaces to generate activities that bring people and those activate the indoor mall. He further commented there is the possibility that this could be greater intensity and that is what they are after in

the downtown. And that is why they want a lot of people living in the towers and going out and doing business. He commented it takes increased intensity to make a desert city work. So, packing a lot of things into a tight little streets and bringing in urban housing is what they need to do.

COMMISSIONER HEITEL stated he has seen a lot of different iterations and he would like to applaud the architects. He further stated he liked the nostalgic feel.

MR. D'ANDREA inquired if there were any opportunities to have retail on the inside for the residents. Mr. Heiney stated most of the retail is focused toward the street and wraps to the ends.

MR. SCHMITT stated he has had the chance to follow the evolution of this project and it has come a long way from where it started. He further stated on the space plan between towers J and K seems to be strongly separated from the canal bank. He noted he would like to see that space open up as a public space; a place that invites people in and is not a dead space.

MS. DRAKE noted that this is a moving target. She showed the more current plan. She reviewed how that space would be utilized noting it is a large space. There will be room for events. The programming of the space is something they would work with the city. It is open to public access, and will be an inviting place for people to go.

MR. SCHMITT stated looking at the elevations on Camelback Road and Marshall Way in both cases at the entrance to the inner courtyards there is a second story bridge or breezeway that goes across between the buildings. He inquired about the use or viability. He also inquired if it would benefit those to remain open so it actually makes the building and complex more transparent as seen from the street. Mr. Heiney remarked the bridge joins the two buildings and is meant to be a light structure. Mr. Berry noted it has a practical purpose if someone buys offices on both sides they can move employees and customers.

Mr. Schmitt stated he would hope the developer and the city try to activate the west side of Marshall Way because he felt it is important to the success of Marshall Way.

COUNCILMAN LUKAS inquired if any of the DR Board members have any further comments on the architecture and massing.

MR. CORTEZ asked a series of questions regarding the design elements that are shown in their packet because they seem to be different than what was presented today. Mr. Gawf noted they are different. Mr. Cortez requested that the packet the City Council receives is accurate.

Mr. Cortez requested additional information regarding the stone that would be used. Mr. Heiney presented samples of the types of stone that would be used. He reviewed the materials that would be used on the project.

APPROVED

Mr. Cortez stated he likes the overall elevations itself. He further stated he likes the massing and the depth and the pedestrian scale that has been created those are very positive elements.

MR. JONES stated with regard to the middle section he felt they need to attempt to break down the mass and developed even further to get a scale that is not just all of a sudden in Scottsdale you have big blocks. He further stated it is a difficult proportion to work with. It needs to be a vertical village and needs to respond to the desert sun with overhangs. They need ways to develop features more vertically that might further break down the blockiness and it would become acceptable at that point.

MR. CORTEZ stated with regard to the residential towers he would concur with Mr. Jones. He further stated ideally from a massing standpoint and a sculptural standpoint the towers should be lowered to fit in the context with the overall presentation. However, he does like what the applicant has done with the attempt to break down the mass lowering the residential component.

COMMISSIONER NELSEN stated he is concerned about the use of the red tile. There are more interesting types of tile the same material but different surfaces that could be used. He further stated they should bring it back to the more tactile experience and drawing on some of the traditions of Old Town Scottsdale. They could incorporate a boardwalk type surface that might add some charm.

Commissioner Nelsen expressed his concern regarding the use of tile material at 160 feet in the air. He noted most people who have tile roofs have broken tiles and they fall in winds so it is something to be concerned.

COUNCILMAN LUKAS stated these remarks will be very useful to the City Council, staff, and the developer. She further stated if they have any further remarks to please contact them.

COMMISSIONER GULINO requested the developer provides exhibits on the overall circulation for the site relative to vehicular ingress and egress and service access for the Planning Commission hearing.

ADJOURNMENT

With no further business to discuss, the special joint study session of the Scottsdale Development Review Board and Planning Commission was adjourned at approximately 4:50 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted

"For the Record" Court Reporters